



---

## Q&A on Jarh wa Ta'deel

Transcribed & compiled by: Akram bin Muhammad 'Abdul-Qaadir as-Saylaanee an-Najdee

Source: "Asilah Ahl al Usoomah bil Baydaa" of Shaykh Muqbil bin Haadee al Waadi'ee

Version 1.1

---

**"If a Faasiq (rebellious) sinner comes to you with news then verify it"**

Transcribed & compiled by: Akram bin Muhammad 'Abdul-Qaadir as-Saylaanee an-Najdee

Source: "Asilah Ahl al Usoomah bil Baydaa" of Shaykh Muqbil bin Haadee al Waadi'ee

## Q&A on Jarh wa Ta'deel



**Transcribed & Compiled by Akram bin Muhammad an-Najdee**

### **The First Question:**

The Questioner says: There are those who say that taking the statements of the scholars on people is considered Blind Following (Taqleed), so what is the authenticity of this statement?

**The Shaykh (رحمه الله) said:**

All Praise is due to Allaah and May Allaah send His Salaah and Salaam upon our Prophet Muhammad, and upon his family and companions and those who follow him. And I testify that there is nothing worthy of worship except for Allaah alone with no partners and I testify that Muhammad is His servant and His Messenger, to proceed:

- For this speech is old from some of the innovators. For as-San'aanee mentioned in his book *Irshaad an-Nuqqaad Ilaa Tayseer al-Ijtihad* that the innovators say: You people forbid Taqleed (blind following) and you people blindly follow Yahya bin Ma'een, so if Yahya says about a man: "Reliable" then you people say: "Reliable", and if al-Bukhaaree says: "Hadeeth Saheeh (authentic)" then you people say: "Saheeh (authentic)", so then you people are blind followers. And as-San'aanee answered in his great and valuable book, *Irshaad an-Nuqqaad Ilaa Tayseer al-Ijtihad*: Verily this is not from the chapter of Taqleed (blind following) and indeed it is from the chapter of Qubool Khabr ath-Thiqqah (Accepting the reliable narrations). And Allaah – عز وجل – says in His Noble Book:

**((O you who Believe, if a Faasiq (rebellious sinner) comes to you with news then verify it, lest you harm people in ignorance, and afterwards you become regretful to what you have done.))<sup>1</sup>**

So this verse is a proof of their understanding that if a Just person comes to us then we accept his narration.

---

<sup>1</sup> Soorah al-Hujuraat: 6

Yes. If a denounced person speaks about an Imaam from the Imaams then his statement is not accepted. Imaam adh-Dhahabee – رحمه الله – after mentioning the defaming of al-'Uqaylee of 'Alee bin al-Madeenee and 'Abdur-Razzaaq and a group of the scholars, then what O brothers, adh-Dhahabee denounced him saying to him:

*((Do you not have any intellect O 'Uqaylee? You come to the great Imaams and you speak about them? For one of them is better than you!))* Or with this meaning.

So if a denounced person speaks about and Imaam from the major Imaams then his statement is not accepted, such as that: The speech of al-Qaradaawee on Shaykh Ibn Baaz, that 'Abdul-Majeed ar-Raymee read in the Jaami' ad-Da'wah. Yes, the Jaami' ad-Da'wah O brothers, spread from it Sunan until it came upon the hand of 'Abdul-Majeed ar-Raymee and he infected it. And 'Abdul-Majeed read the speech of al-Qaradaawee supporting it. And the ignorant people of Yemen listened to him, went out and cursed Shaykh ibn Baaz – and I was informed about this from a reliable brother, 'Abdur-Rahmaan bin 'Ayshaan – so if a fallen person such as 'Abdul-Majeed ar-Raymee or Yoosuf al-Qaradaawee comes and they defame an Imaam from the Imaams of the Muslims, then his speech and honor is not accepted. Yes. And also al-Haafidh adh-Dhahabee narrates: Abul-Fath al-Azdee came – and he is Muhammad bin al-Hussayn – came and declared some of the Imaams as weak, so Imaam adh-Dhahabee said:

*((He said: This on is an Imaam and Abul Fath al-Azdee is weak, and his biography will come in those who have been praised))*

So what now? What is important is that Jarh wa Ta'deel (Criticism and Praise) is a matter which is not Taqleed (blind following). By Allaah if a denounced one defames an Imaam from the Imaams, such as what Muhammad Zaahid al-Kawtharee – May Allaah not reward him with good – did, his defaming of Anas bin Maalik, and defaming of Imaam Maalik bin Anas, and his defaming of Imaam ash-Shaafi'ee and his defaming of Imaam Ahmad bin Hanbal and his defaming of al-Bukaharee and his defaming of Ibn Hibbaan and his defaming of ad-Daaruuqutnee, and so on to his time, such as this fallen one, then his defaming is not agreed with, his defaming is not agreed with:

*The over whelming ocean is not harmed  
If the fool throws a stone in it*

So these individuals are not harmed by the defamation of this fallen one Muhammad Zaahid al-Kawtharee, and they are not harmed and like this.

O our brothers, as for the Imaams, and those who spoke about the innovators, then the Lord - العزة - said in his Noble Book: - what you heard from the verse:

**((If a Faasiq (rebellious) sinner comes to you with news then verify it))<sup>2</sup>**

---

<sup>2</sup> Soorah al-Hujuraat: 6

Its understanding is that if a Just person comes to us then we accept his narration. And Imaam Muslim reported in his Saheeh from the authority of Tameem ad-Daaree – رضي الله عنه – that he said: The Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

*((The religion is sincere advice))*

And in the Saheehayn (al-Bukhaaree and Muslim) from the hadeeth of Jareer bin 'Abdillaah al-Bajlee that he said:

*((We took the pledge with the Messenger of Allaah (صلى الله عليه وسلم) to establish the Prayer and give the Zakaat and advise every Muslim))*

O brothers, the people constantly defend with anything they can! Look at the classes that 'Abdul-Majeed az-Zindaanee speaks about the Majlis ash-Shaykhaat – The council of female scholars in Yemen – just as in the disbelieving countries he mentioned this and some of them say: “By Allaah this speech is not good, however is this voice that of 'Abdul-Majeed az-Zindaanee? Is it the voice of 'Abdul-Majeed az-Zindaanee?” O Brothers! Listen! Listen! – May Allaah bless you – until you do not become sad from this stubbornness. Allaah – سبحانه وتعالى – says about the stubborn ones:

**((14. And even if We opened to them a gate from the heaven and they were to continue ascending thereto**

**15. They would surely say: "Our eyes have been (as if) dazzled. Nay, we are a people bewitched."))<sup>3</sup>**

The stubborn ones O brothers, we cannot do anything for them. We may say: “Daraba” is an action of the past, he will say: “No it is an imperative action, an imperative action. Who said to you that it is a past action?” You say to him: “The sun rises from over there.” He will say to you: “Not there, this is from the West, but you do not see, you do not see” So the stubborn one, inform them that we are not able to reach them however we have for them the Book of our Lord and the Sunnah of our Prophet Muhammad (صلى الله عليه وسلم). O activist! O activist! Return and Repent to Allaah! And Allaah is the one who Aids.

#### **The Fourth Question:**

The questioner says: O Noble Shaykh: There are those who say that the speech of the Salafee scholars towards the Hizbiyyeen (biased partisans) is from envy, which occurs between the scholars? So what is your reply to that?

---

<sup>3</sup> Soorah al-Hijr: 14 - 15

**The Answer:**

Upon what do they have envy? Their Masaajid whereof their students were many, when the people smelt the smell of Hizbiyyah, there was only one in his Masjid, just one remaining in his Masjid! So upon what do they envy? We envy them for the Duniyaa?! We left it (the Duniyaa) with the Praise of Allaah – and we praise Allaah that has made us prosper and made us content in our hearts from the Duniyaa – and the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) was truthful when he said, as in the hadeeth of Abee Sa'eed al-Khudree in the Saheehayn:

*((And he who remains patient, Allaah will bestow patience upon him, and he who is satisfied with what he has, Allaah will make him self-sufficient. And there is no gift better and vast (you may be given) than patience))*

So I do not know anything to be envious of them, rather we desire that they return to the Sunnah and we desire this and we are gentle with them as well, and we are gentle with them as well.

**The Tenth question:**

The Questioner says: O Noble Shaykh, there are those that say that the speech of the Hizbiyyeen and warning from them is from Gheebah (Backbiting), so what do you say about that?

I am exhausted O brothers, and this question we have answered it many times, and we answered it before this tape that the Prophet (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

*((The religion is sincere advice))*

And the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم), according to their madhhab (way) was from those people who backbite the people, the Messenger Salallahu alaihi wa salam... The Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم), according to their madhhab was of those that backbite the people, however some of the people, O brothers, they do not understand – the common people do not understand – what speech they are referring to – By Allaah it is correct – so what do you hear? – May Allaah Bless you – : the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

*((Are you a person who causes Fitnah O Mu'aadh?))*

And he said about the Khawaarij:

*((They will pass through the religion as the arrow passes through its target))*

And he said about the Khawaarij:

*((They are the dogs of the Hell-Fire))*

And he said about the one who called upon him:

*((What an evil brother to his tribe he is))*

And he said to Abee Dharr:

*((Indeed you are a person who has with him something of Jaahiliyyah (Pre-Islaamic Ignorance)))*

And just like this he said about his women:

*((You are like the Sawaahib (the women who came to Yoosuf) of Yoosuf))*

This speech they do not know O brothers! This speech they do not know O our brothers!  
– May Allaah Bless you – Yes. The Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

*((The religion is sincere advice))*

And Allaah says:

**((Let there arise from you a group of people who enjoin the Good and forbid the Evil and they are the Successful ones))**

And the Messenger (صلى الله عليه وسلم) said:

*((Whoever from you sees an evil then he should change it with his hand, and if he is not able then with his tongue, and if he is not able then with his heart and that is the weakest of Eemaan))*

So what is important, with All Praise belonging to Allaah, we mentioned a beneficial statement in the introduction to al-Makhraj.

Imaam ash-Shaafi'ee, this one backbit the people, why?! Because he said:

*((Narrating from Haraam bin 'Uthmaan is Haraam (Forbidden)))*

Imaam ash-Shaafi'ee is free from backbiting, however not according to the Madhhab of the ignorant.

And the one who said:

*((The one who reports from al-Bayaadh, Allaah will whiten his eyes (meaning cause him to go blind)))*



And some of the Soofees came to Imaam Ahmad and said to him:

*((You backbite the people))*

He said:

*((No, if I remain silent and so-and-so remain silent then who will clarify to the people?))*

So it is incumbent to clarify! Yes. And from standing up in the face of the Hizbiyyeen, yes, why do you criticize us and Sa'tar – May Allaah not bless him – said: that we are workers for America, and he said that we are also the brothers of the communists. - Yes. And his tapes are between our hands - and likewise you speak about us and insult us and speak ill of us without the Truth and do not speak with the Truth! O our brothers!

***((There is no good in much of their secret talk, except those who order with truthfulness or good or rectifying between the people, whoever does that seeking the pleasure of Allaah, we will give him a great reward))***

We wish we could be silent, but it is not possible for us to be silent, and we know that if we be silent: then the Ikhwaani, and the people of Jam'iyyah al-Hikmah and Jam'iyyah al-Ihsaan and likewise the secularists and other than them will possibly be labeled with "Shaykh al-Islam". No! However we will not be silent even if they say what they say. And with the praise of Allaah we do not pay attention to them or to their speech, for we know that with us are faults and that we are not infallible and we know as well that we are firm upon our religion, May Allaah make us all firm upon what He Loves and is Pleased with, and All Praise is due to Allaah, the Lord of all the worlds.

From the tape: "Asillah Ahl al-'Usoomah bil Baydaa'" of Shaykh Abee Abdir-Rahmaan Muqbil bin Haadee al-Waadi'ee (رحمه الله)

